The OCR limbo: How low can you go?

Summary

- An OCR of -0.25% or even lower is technically possible. However, at some point a lower OCR becomes ineffective and beyond that, potentially outright contractionary. Where this point might lie is highly uncertain.
- There is a risk that the mortgage credit channel becomes ineffective if the OCR goes below +0.50%. An OCR below -0.25% is unlikely to be passed through to corporate borrowers, given 'zero floors' in contracts. But the NZD channel is likely to still be effective down to even lower levels of the OCR.
- Overall, we are not at all certain that the impact of a negative OCR across all channels would be net stimulatory.

Limits to low policy rates

With the OCR widely forecast to be at 0.75% by the end of the year and the global outlook shaky, the RBNZ’s foray into uncharted territory looks set to continue.

Negative policy rates have become far from rare overseas, and, at the August MPS, the RBNZ mentioned that negative interest rates are part of the unconventional monetary policy toolkit. So how low could we go?

There are several constraints on lower policy rates, determining how low the OCR could fall.

- The zero lower bound was once thought of as a common-sense limit. Charging people to lend you money? Ridiculous. But global experience over the past decade shows that common sense is no longer a constraint.
- The effective lower bound is the point at which the net impact of a still-lower policy rate would no longer be stimulatory – and may even flip to contractionary – for economic activity. The various channels for monetary policy will hit their limits at different policy rates, and the point at which lower rates become counter-productive overall is very difficult to estimate – hard enough to identify at the time, let alone in advance.
- The physical lower bound is where the transmission of monetary policy completely breaks down as mass cash hoarding takes place. It is the interest rate at which people will prefer to take out wads of cash and pay to store and insure it. Short of banning high-denomination notes or cash altogether (ideas that have been seriously suggested), this is as far as it is possible to go. Theoretically this bound is around -0.75% or slightly lower.

In this paper we focus on the murky effective lower bound. To assess where this might lie, we must examine the different channels for monetary policy.

The various monetary policy channels have different limits

There are several key channels through which lower policy rates impact the economy: mortgage lending, corporate lending, the exchange rate, and inflation expectations. We go through each in turn.
**Mortgage lending channel**

Traditionally, the most powerful monetary policy transmission channel in New Zealand has been the pass-through to interest rates for mortgage borrowers. As figure 1 shows, the cuts taking the OCR from 1.75% to 1.00% this year have been extremely effective in lowering mortgage rates, albeit by different amounts at various maturities.

It’s not just the floating mortgage rate that has fallen; the entire mortgage curve has dropped as the wholesale yield curve has priced in a lower-for-longer OCR (and the relentless global rally in long rates had a big part to play too).

Figure 1. NZ mortgage rate curve

However, from here on down, as we discussed in our Weekly of 26 August, competition for bank deposits as the key funding source may limit OCR pass-through to deposit rates. It isn’t entirely clear where the floor for deposit rates is. Internationally, over the past decade, negative policy rates have in some cases been passed through to corporate deposit rates – particularly for very large deposits – but banks have been reluctant to pass on negative rates to households.

Here in New Zealand, it would likely take a more negative policy rate than elsewhere to push deposit rates towards zero. International evidence suggests that the more reliant a banking system is on domestic deposits for funding, the more constrained banks will be in taking these rates lower. In New Zealand, as a result of core funding rules passed in 2010 designed to reduce reliance on short-term foreign wholesale funding, banks are very dependent on household deposits. This naturally limits how far/how fast deposit rates can fall, reducing pass-through of cuts to the OCR to lending rates as well. A near-zero deposit rate could probably still be brought about, but it would potentially take a deeply negative OCR to achieve it, and it would be associated with a sharp hit to credit availability if bank deposits fell markedly as a result. This effect would be in addition to the negative impact on banks’ appetite to lend that comes from squeezed margins.

Generally, negative interest rates have been effective in lowering mortgage rates overseas, albeit not 1:1. But in some cases, such as in Switzerland, mortgage rates perversely increased as policy rates fell deeply negative, as banks attempted to retain margins and profitability.

The diminished pass-through of the lower OCR to bank funding costs/deposit rates (and hence lending rates) already observed suggests that the OCR in New Zealand may already not be all that far from the effective lower bound for the mortgage lending channel. We will have to watch the behaviour of mortgage rates to gauge when it has been hit.
Of course, the bulk of New Zealand mortgage borrowing is on fixed terms. A reduced pass-through to the floating mortgage rate from a lower OCR is therefore of less concern if fixed rates continue to fall. However, the New Zealand yield curve is already extremely flat – there is just 40bp difference between the 3-month and the 15-year yield currently, suggesting limited downside for fixed mortgage rates from here too. Of course, were longer mortgage rates to rise because of increasing bank funding costs, for example, the RBNZ could intervene to offset that. But that’s a case of running to stand still, not adding stimulus versus today’s baseline, with funding conditions currently benign.

An important additional consideration is that squeezed margins and reduced bank profitability could reduce credit availability, further hampering monetary policy transmission. Appetite to lend is of course not directly observable, but credit growth will require close monitoring as well.

All up, we estimate the effective lower bound for the mortgage lending channel could kick in around +0.50%. From that point on, the RBNZ would have to closely monitor both rate transmission and credit growth to determine whether the mortgage interest rate channel is still effective.

**Corporate lending channel**

An OCR below -0.25% is unlikely to be passed through to many corporate borrowers given the ‘zero floors’ that are prevalent in lending contracts in New Zealand. Many documents specify that the floating rate will be the BKBM rate or 0% (eg ‘if the 3-month BKBM rate is less than 0%, then it will be deemed 0%’). This means that an OCR below about -0.25% would not be passed through to these borrowers, assuming a BKBM-OCR spread of 20-25bp, which has been the historical average. It is worth noting that if funding conditions were to tighten, however, this spread would likely widen, making the effective floor higher.

Another factor to bear in mind is that corporate borrowers can hedge their floating rate risk using a swap transaction, but these swaps are not subject to the same ‘zero floor’ provisions, meaning that negative rates would result in mismatch risk and impaired hedging.

**Exchange rate channel**

The exchange rate channel is very important in a small, open economy such as New Zealand. A negative policy rate would be passed through to wholesale and money markets, and would likely keep downward pressure on the NZD through narrower interest rate differentials with the rest of the world, easing overall monetary conditions.

Accordingly, the RBNZ may deem that an OCR lower than -0.25% could be appropriate if the benefits of a lower exchange rate are seen to outweigh the downsides via other channels, eg tightening credit availability.

And of course, interest rate differentials are not the only drivers of the NZD – commodity prices and global risk aversion seize the wheel regularly too (figure 2). Direct currency intervention remains an option as well, though the BAU constraints on when this can be implemented are fairly binding. That could be changed, of course.
Inflation expectations channel

The final channel for monetary policy is inflation expectations. Inflation expectations are self-reinforcing; if firms expect higher inflation, they will set prices and offer wage rises in line with this.

The theory goes that lower policy rates will lead to higher inflation expectations as a higher economic growth rate is anticipated. However, policy rate cuts do tend to bring about a flurry of bad news stories, including about how inflation is looking likely to undershoot the target.

Abroad, the effect of prolonged negative interest rates on inflation expectations (and inflation for that matter) has been mixed. Sweden is a good case study of how unconventional monetary policy (including negative interest rates since 2015) helped to lift inflation expectations back towards target. But in Japan, inflation expectations actually fell when negative interest rates were implemented.

Here in New Zealand, there is no evidence yet that the most recent 50bp cut in the OCR has increased inflation expectations, but the OCR cuts of 2016 did help stem the decline in inflation expectations at that time (figure 3). We will be watching the surveys closely from here, as will the RBNZ, no doubt.

Figure 3. Inflation expectations and the OCR

Source: RBNZ, ANZ Research.
Putting it all together

As we discussed in our note of 17 July, we estimate that a low in the OCR of -0.25% is technically possible – and indeed an even lower rate can be achieved but likely at a significant cost to both interbank market functioning and bank profitability. Adding quantitative easing at the same time would up the ante further, requiring some technical fixes (including facility repricing).

With an OCR of say -0.25%, ‘zero floors’ in corporate borrowers’ contracts will be kicking in, mortgage rates will likely no longer be falling, and negative impacts on credit availability may be at play. The exchange rate would likely be providing stimulus. But it is not self-evident that, without further interventions to offset the negative impacts, monetary policy would still be stimulatory on balance.

To mitigate the costs imposed on the banking system and ensure smooth transmission of a lower OCR to mortgage rates, the RBNZ could alter their tiering structures for bank reserves (so a smaller proportion is subject to negative rates) and/or implement term lending facilities at favourable interest rates to promote lending, such as Europe’s TLTROs. Targeted term lending could promote lending by extending loans to banks at favourable rates, conditional on how much those banks lend to the real economy.

These policies may mean that the OCR could go lower than otherwise. But it’s fair to say that Europe’s experience of prolonged negative policy rates is not an inspiring example to follow, with persistent mispricing of risk, inflated asset prices, worsening inequality, the hollowing out of pension schemes, misallocation of resources, unsustainable government and private debt, inflation persistently under target, and the wholesale destruction of value in the banking system. But we digress.

Based on the discussion above, the effective lower bound for the OCR across all channels, ie the point at which it is no longer stimulatory for near-term activity, could be anywhere between +0.5% and -0.75% (figure 4), depending on at what point credit availability is significantly impacted and pass-through stops, and also the effectiveness of the exchange rate channel.

Figure 4. The OCR and potential lower bounds

If the OCR hits +0.5% the RBNZ will have to closely monitor whether lower interest rates are actually being passed through, whether credit availability is being constrained, and what collateral damage is being caused. Negative interest rates may no longer be uncommon, but they have not been universal, because of exactly these kinds of considerations. The Bank of England has never gone below 0.25%. The Federal Reserve called it quits at 0-0.25% (figure 5).
All up, we are not at all certain that a negative OCR would be net stimulatory, but we see -0.25% as a likely limit to how far the OCR could fall. That said, it is possible that the RBNZ could push below this level if it deems it can encourage lending via other means and/or concludes that other channels (in particular, via the NZD) are still effective and likely to outweigh other costs.

Given the uncertainties it may be prudent as the OCR goes below 0.5% to move in smaller steps to cautiously assess whether policy is transmitting effectively or not – for example, in 10bp increments (similar to the ECB and BoJ), rather than the traditional 25bp steps. Alternatively, the RBNZ could avoid negative rates altogether and turn to quantitative easing measures instead (like the Federal Reserve and Bank of England).

**Official communication**

The RBNZ is at a “very early stage” of unconventional work, but Governor Orr has publically stated a preference for negative interest rates over quantitative easing. We would be far more cautious about jumping to this conclusion, but it is fair to say that a negative OCR is likely to be in the toolkit if the economy were to go into recession or possibly even just if inflation remains stubbornly low.

In 2018, the RBNZ published an unconventional monetary policy scoping document. Following this, then Assistant Governor John McDermott mentioned -0.75% as a possible lower limit for the OCR, but a more likely lower limit around -0.5%. McDermott also noted that it could be detrimental to leave rates negative for too long.

Recently, the RBNZ has pulled back from citing a specific number, noting that there is wide uncertainty around how low the OCR could go. A Treasury document cited -0.20% to -0.35% as a possible limit on the OCR – this was based on an estimate of this being the point at which corporate bond rates may reach 0%, increasing the risk of cash hoarding.

As interest rates probe ever lower uncharted territory, the RBNZ Monetary Policy Committee will have to closely watch whether policy is transmitting effectively through the economy, figure out which channels are working well and which are not, and assess what can be done about it. It will need to carefully assess whether further OCR cuts are likely to be a help or a hindrance to the economy overall. It’s complicated.
This document is intended for ANZ’s institutional, professional or wholesale clients, and not for individuals or retail persons. It should not be forwarded, copied or distributed. The information in this document is general in nature, and does not constitute personal financial product advice or take into account your objectives, financial situation or needs.

This document may be restricted by law in certain jurisdictions. Persons who receive this document must inform themselves about and observe all relevant restrictions.

Disclaimer for all Jurisdictions: This document is prepared and distributed in your country/region by either: Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Limited (ABN11 005 357 522) (ANZ); or its relevant subsidiary or branch (each, an Affiliate), as appropriate or as set out below.

This document is distributed on the basis that it is only for the information of the specified recipient or permitted user of the relevant website (recipients).

This document is solely for informational purposes and nothing contained within is intended to be an invitation, solicitation or offer by ANZ to sell, or buy, receive or provide any product or service, or to participate in a particular trading strategy.

Distribution of this document to you is only as may be permissible by the laws of your jurisdiction, and is not directed to or intended for distribution or use by recipients resident or located in jurisdictions where its use or distribution would be contrary to those laws or regulations, or in jurisdictions where ANZ would be subject to additional licensing or registration requirements. Further, the products and services mentioned in this document may not be available in all countries.

ANZ in no way provides any financial, legal, taxation or investment advice to you in connection with any product or service discussed in this document. Before making any investment decision, recipients should seek independent financial, legal, tax and other relevant advice having regard to their particular circumstances.

Whilst care has been taken in the preparation of this document and the information contained within is believed to be accurate, ANZ does not represent or warrant the accuracy or completeness of the information. Further, ANZ does not accept any responsibility to inform you of any matters that subsequently come to its notice, which may affect the accuracy of the information in this document.

Preparation of this document and the opinions expressed in it may involve material elements of subjective judgement and analysis. Unless specifically stated otherwise: they are current on the date of this document and are subject to change without notice; and, all price information is indicative only. Any opinions expressed in this document are subject to change at any time without notice.

ANZ does not guarantee the performance of any product mentioned in this document. All investments entail a risk and may result in both profits and losses. Past performance is not necessarily an indicator of future performance. The products and services described in this document may not be suitable for all investors, and transacting in these products or services may be considered risky.

ANZ expressly disclaims any responsibility and shall not be liable for any loss, damage, claim, liability, proceedings, cost or expense (Liability) arising directly or indirectly and whether in tort (including negligence), contract, equity or otherwise out of or in connection with this document to the extent permissible under relevant law. Please note, the contents of this document have not been reviewed by any regulatory body or authority in any jurisdiction.

ANZ and its Affiliates may have an interest in the subject matter of this document. They may receive fees from customers for dealing in the products or services described in this document, and their staff and introducers of business may share in such fees or remuneration that may be influenced by total sales, at all times received and/or apportioned in accordance with local regulatory requirements. Further, they or their customers may have or have had interests or long or short positions in the products or services described in this document, and may at any time make purchases and/or sales in them as principal or agent, as well as act (or have acted) as a market maker in such products. This document is published in accordance with ANZ’s policies on conflicts of interest and ANZ maintains appropriate information barriers to control the flow of information between businesses within it and its Affiliates.

Your ANZ point of contact can assist with any questions about this document including for further information on these disclosures of interest.

Country/region specific information: Unless stated otherwise, this document is distributed by Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Limited (ANZ).

Australia. ANZ holds an Australian Financial Services licence no. 234527. For a copy of ANZ’s Financial Services Guide please click here or call 13 37 96 and from our ANZ point of contact. ANZ’s trading strategies or recommendations are included in this document. They are solely for the information of ‘wholesale clients’ (as defined in section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001 Cth).

Brazil, Brunei, India, Japan, Kuwait, Malaysia, Switzerland, Taiwan. This document is distributed in each of these jurisdictions by ANZ on a cross-border basis.

Cambodia. This document is distributed in Cambodia by ANZ Royal Bank (Cambodia) Limited (ANZ Royal Bank). The recipient acknowledges that although ANZ Royal Bank is a subsidiary of ANZ, it is a separate entity to ANZ and the obligations of ANZ Royal Bank do not constitute deposits or other liabilities of ANZ and ANZ is not required to meet the obligations of ANZ Royal Bank.

European Economic Area (EEA): United Kingdom. ANZ is authorised in the United Kingdom by the Prudential Regulation Authority (PRA) and is subject to regulation by the Financial Conduct Authority (FCA) and limited regulation by the PRA. Details about the extent of our regulation by the PRA are available from us on request. This document is distributed in the United Kingdom by Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Limited ANZ solely for the information of persons who would come within the FCA definition of “eligible counterparty” or “professional client”. It is not intended for and must not be distributed to any person who would come within the FCA definition of “retail client”. Nothing here excludes or restricts any duty or liability to a customer which ANZ may have under the UK Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 or under the regulatory system as defined in the Rules of the Prudential Regulation Authority (PRA) and the FCA. ANZ is authorised in the United Kingdom by the PRA and is subject to regulation by the FCA and limited regulation by the PRA. Details about the extent of our regulation by the PRA are available from us on request.

Fiji. For Fiji regulatory purposes, this document and any views and recommendations are not to be deemed as investment advice. Fiji investors must seek licensed professional advice should they wish to make any investment in relation to this document.

Hong Kong. This publication is issued or distributed in Hong Kong by the Hong Kong branch of ANZ, which is registered at the Hong Kong Monetary Authority to conduct Type 1 (dealing in securities), Type 4 (advising on securities) and Type 6 (advising on corporate finance) regulated activities. The contents of this publication have not been reviewed by any regulatory authority in Hong Kong.

India. If this document is received in India, only you (the specified recipient) may print it provided that before doing so, you specify on it your name and place of printing.
Myanmar. This publication is intended to be general and part of ANZ’s customer service and marketing activities when implementing its functions as a licensed bank. This publication is not Securities Investment Advice (as that term is defined in the Myanmar Securities Transaction Law 2013).

New Zealand. This document is intended to be of a general nature, does not take into account your financial situation or goals, and is not a personalised adviser service under the Financial Advisers Act 2008 (FAA).

Oman. ANZ neither has a registered business presence nor a representative office in Oman and does not undertake banking business or provide financial services in Oman. Consequently ANZ is not regulated by either the Central Bank of Oman or Oman’s Capital Market Authority. The information contained in this document is for discussion purposes only and neither constitutes an offer of securities in Oman as contemplated by the Commercial Companies Law of Oman (Royal Decree 4/74) or the Capital Market Law of Oman (Royal Decree 80/98), nor does it constitute an offer to sell, or the solicitation of any offer to buy non-Omani securities in Oman as contemplated by Article 139 of the Executive Regulations to the Capital Market Law (issued vide CMA Decision 1/2009). ANZ does not solicit business in Oman and the only circumstances in which ANZ sends information or material describing financial products or financial services to recipients in Oman, is where such information or material has been requested from ANZ and the recipient understands, acknowledges and agrees that this document has not been approved by the CBO, the CMA or any other regulatory body or authority in Oman. ANZ does not market, offer, sell or distribute any financial or investment products or services in Oman and has no subscription to any securities, products or services of such entities. Coaching may be available. Nothing contained in this document is intended to constitute Omani investment, legal, tax, accounting or other professional advice.

People’s Republic of China (PRC). This document may be distributed by either ANZ or Australia and New Zealand Bank (China) Company Limited (ANZ China). Recipients must comply with all applicable laws and regulations of PRC, including any prohibitions on speculative transactions and CNY/CNH arbitrage trading. If this document is distributed by ANZ or an Affiliate (other than ANZ China), the following shall apply and the text below is applicable: No action has been taken by ANZ or any affiliate which would permit a public offering of any products or services of such an entity or distribution or re-distribution of this document in the PRC. Accordingly, the products and services of such entities are not being offered or sold within the PRC by means of this document or any other document. This document may not be distributed, re-distributed or published in the PRC, except under circumstances that will result in compliance with any applicable laws and regulations. If and when the material accompanying this document relates to the products and/or services of ANZ China, the following statement and the text below is applicable: This document is distributed by ANZ China in the Mainland of the PRC.

Qatar. This document has not been, and will not be:
- lodged or registered with, or reviewed or approved by, the Qatar Central Bank (QCB), the Qatar Financial Centre (QFC) Authority, QFC Regulatory Authority or any other authority in the State of Qatar (Qatar); or
- authorised or licensed for distribution in Qatar, and the information contained in this document does not, and is not intended to, constitute a public offer or other invitation in respect of securities in Qatar or the QFC. The financial products or services described in this document have not been, and will not be:
  - registered with the QCB, QFC Authority, QFC Regulatory Authority or any other governmental authority in Qatar; or
  - authorised or licensed for offering, marketing, issue or sale, directly or indirectly, in Qatar.

Accordingly, the financial products or services described in this document are not being, and will not be, offered, issued or sold in Qatar, and this document is not being, and will not be, distributed in Qatar. The offering, marketing, issue and sale of the financial products or services described in this document and distribution of this document is being made, and is subject to the laws, regulations and rules of jurisdictions outside of Qatar and the QFC. Recipients of this document must abide by this restriction and not distribute this document in breach of this restriction. This document is being sent/issued to a limited number of institutional and/or sophisticated investors (i) upon their request and confirmation that they understand the statements above; and (ii) on the condition that it will not be provided to any person other than the original recipient, and is not for general circulation and may not be reproduced or used for any other purpose.

Singapore. This document is distributed in Singapore by the Singapore branch of ANZ solely for the information of “accredited investors”, “expert investors” or (as the case may be) “institutional investors” (each term as defined in the Securities and Futures Act Cap. 289 of Singapore). ANZ is licensed in Singapore under the Banking Act Cap. 19 of Singapore and is exempted from holding a financial adviser’s licence under Section 231(1)(a) of the Financial Advisers Act Cap. 100 of Singapore.

United Arab Emirates (UAE). This document is distributed in the UAE or the Dubai International Financial Centre (DIFC) (as applicable) by ANZ, and is not intended to constitute: (a) an offer of securities anywhere in the UAE; (b) the carrying on or engagement in banking, financial and/or investment consultation business in the UAE under the rules and regulations made by the Central Bank of the UAE, the Emirates Securities and Commodities Authority or the UAE Ministry of Economy; (c) an offer of securities within the meaning of the Dubai International Financial Centre Markets Law (DIFCML) No. 12 of 2004; and (d) a financial promotion, as defined under the DIFCML No. 1 of 200. ANZ DIFC Branch is regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority (DFSA). ANZ DIFC Branch is regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority (DFSA). The financial products or services described in this document are only available to persons who qualify as “Professional Clients” or “Market Counterparty” in accordance with the provisions of the DFSA rules. In addition, ANZ has a representative office (ANZ Representative Office) in Abu Dhabi regulated by the Central Bank of the UAE. The ANZ Representative Office is not permitted by the Central Bank of the UAE to provide any banking services to clients in the UAE.

United States. Except where this is a FX- related document, this document is distributed in the United States by ANZ Securities, Inc. (ANZ SI) which is a member of the Financial Regulatory Authority (FINRA) (www.finra.org) and registered with the SEC. ANZSI’s address is 277 Park Avenue, 31st Floor, New York, NY 10172, USA (Tel: +1 212 801 9160 Fax: +1 212 801 9163). ANZSI accepts responsibility for its content. Information on any securities referred to in this document may be obtained from ANZSI upon request. This document or material is intended for institutional use only – not retail. If you are an institutional customer wishing to effect transactions in any securities referred to in this document you must contact ANZSI, not its affiliates. ANZSI is authorised as a broker-dealer only for institutional customers, not for US Persons (as “US person” is defined in Regulation S under the US Securities Act of 1933, as amended) who are individuals. If you have registered to use this website or have otherwise received this document and are a US Person who is an individual: to avoid loss, you should cease to use this website by unsubscribing or should notify the sender and you should not act on the contents of this document in any way. Non-U.S. analysts: Non-U.S. analysts may not be associated persons of ANZSI and therefore may not act in breach of FINRA Rule 2242 restrictions on communications with the subject company, public appearances and trading securities held by the analysts. Where this is an FX-related document, it is distributed in the United States by ANZ’s New York Branch, which is also located at 277 Park Avenue, 31st Floor, New York, NY 10172, USA (Tel: +1 212 801 9160 Fax: +1 212 801 9163).

Vietnam. This document is distributed in Vietnam by ANZ or ANZ Bank (Vietnam) Limited, a subsidiary of ANZ.

This document has been prepared by ANZ Bank New Zealand Limited, Level 26, 23-29 Albert Street, Auckland 1010, New Zealand, Ph 64-9-357 4094, e-mail nzecconomics@anz.com, http://www.anz.co.nz